

Table 1: Instances where the TCD/UCD submission misinterprets or misrepresents what is set out in the ETG Report

Topic	TCD/UCD Submission	ETG Report
Pilot Study	<i>'a pilot study... would demonstrate the feasibility of the extraction technique'</i> pg 5	<i>'it would be essential that a pilot or feasibility study be undertaken.'</i> Section 5.4, pg 47.
DNA Costs	<i>'the costs associated with this pilot study are marginal and likely to be significantly cheaper than the figures quoted in the ETG report'</i> pg 5 <i>'The cost associated with such [DNA] analyses would be significantly less than the figures quoted in the ETG Report'</i> pg 8	No figures quoted for any DNA analysis. <i>'The cost implications may vary considerably, based on what DNA technologies may be possible or pursued.'</i> Section 5.4, pg 49.
Focus on DNA	<i>'foremost in the report was an "assessment of [the] application of DNA technologies' (ETG Report, iii) to identify the remains.'</i> pg 5	<i>'Application of DNA technologies'</i> is listed as one of seven factors for consideration. Executive Summary, iii
DNA Extraction	<i>'ETG report documents a number of potential problems... of the destructive process associated with DNA extraction'</i> pg 6	<i>'time-consuming and technically difficult as specialist DNA extraction techniques have to be applied.'</i> Section 3.5.3, pg 27. <i>'certainly the date of the remains from Tuam do not preclude DNA extraction'</i> Section 5.4, pg 47.
DNA Preservation	<i>'Report alludes to the problems associated with DNA degradation as a consequence of age and the environment'</i> pg 6 <i>'DNA degradation is a serious issue for both STR and SNP array analysis and depends on a number of factors, including age, the environment, the source...'</i> pg 7	<i>'Of primary importance to the prospects of success is the condition of the remains... defining factor relates to the age... Environmental conditions also play an important role'</i> Section 3.5.3, pg 28.
DNA technologies	<i>'the emphasis and focus solely on STR analysis as the only means to confirm identity is surprising'</i> pg 6	<i>'MtDNA, in forensic cases, would... be considered if STR profiles fail due to degradation'</i> Section 3.5.3, pg 29.
Familial DNA	<i>'[ETG] refer to potential difficulty of collecting ante-mortem samples'</i> pg 6	<i>'One of the final defining factors... is the availability of ante-mortem samples'</i> Section 3.5.3, pg 28.
DNA Database	<i>'Forensic Evidence and DNA Database System'</i> pg 7	Discussed extensively in Section 3.8, pg 35.
Petrous Bone	<i>'Using the petrous bone would not only be the preferred method for securing DNA, but also for minimising damages to the human remains'</i> pg 8	<i>'the petrous portion proved the most reliable'</i> Section 3.5.3, pg 28. <i>'DNA testing of juveniles/infant bones would concentrate on... fully formed'</i>

		<i>teeth... the femur... and the petrous portion'</i> Section 5.4, pg 48.
Mis-comprehension of Commingled contexts	<i>'the use of the petrous bone would allow for ensuring that one individual is analysed at a time and the containment of DNA within the petrous bone ensures minimal DNA contamination'</i> pg 7	<i>'commingled: where dis-articulated remains of two or more skeletons have mixed together'</i> Glossary, pg 59.
Forensic requirement	<i>'legal certainty and precedence dictate that there is a reluctance to adopt a new type of genetic marker [SNP]'</i> pg 7	<i>'factors that make this situation unique: - The forensic requirement of the site;'</i> Executive Summary, i
Tone	<i>'the pessimistic and guarded tone adopted in the ETG Report'</i> pg 8 <i>'the tone adopted by the ETG is decidedly circumspect'</i> pg 5	<i>'The Final Technical Report should address: 3. The potential to identify the remains... and the logistical and technical challenges that would be involved in the event of undertaking such work;'</i> Terms of Reference vii